EXPERIENCE IS THE BEST TEACHER

The case method packs more experience into every hour of learning than any other instructional approach. That’s why it forms the basis of learning at Harvard Business School as well as many other universities around the world.

Case studies provide an immersion experience, bringing students as close as possible to real business situations. Judgment and experience lie at the very core of managerial success.

There is no better way to develop these leadership skills than through case studies from Harvard Business Publishing.
HINTS FOR CASE TEACHING

A HARVARD BUSINESS SCHOOL CASE STUDY | BY PROFESSOR BENSON P. SHAPIRO

Because case teaching is very much a mixture of art and skill, much of the case teacher’s development is through trial and error, experience, and a realistic review of past experience. This self-learning, however, can be effectively supplemented by observing other teachers, by being coached, and by discussing approaches and techniques with other devoted instructors. This note has been written as a complement to all of these approaches and to encourage thought and discussion about case teaching.

The core of case teaching is the facilitation of student learning. Thus, this note will look at the case discussion process from both the instructor’s and student’s points of view. But we begin by setting reasonable expectations for classroom performance and setting a general group of objectives for student development.

EXPECTATIONS AND OBJECTIVES

There is no single approach to case teaching. Instead, there are a wide variety of approaches that work for different people in different situations. Later we will explore some of the similarities, but first we must emphasize the differences, as well as the importance of developing your own style—the one that fits your character, personality, teaching situation, and setting. Thus, the first hint is: Do not strive or expect to simulate another teacher’s style or approach. You should, instead, develop a style that is comfortable for you. If it is not, you will not be effective. Facade does not work in the discussion classroom and has no place there. With enough devotion, concentration, and hard work, almost anyone can become an effective case teacher. Not everyone, however, can become a “star quality” case teacher. And of course, there is no reason for every teacher to strive to be a star. More important, perhaps, is another factor: Even star-quality teachers do not always have star-quality classes. Some classes are inevitably better than others because of the material, the teacher, the fit of the material and teacher, or external events such as an examination in another course, or very good or bad news in the broader world. Also, it is not easy to judge the quality of a class. Certainly a lively class is not necessarily a good one, although it is hard to believe that a boring class could hold the attention of the students and encourage them to prepare with vigor for the next one. That leads us to the second hint: Have reasonable expectations for each class, and understand that some will be better than others. This in no way should detract from the constant striving to improve your performance in each class and to contribute more effectively to the students’ achievement of their objectives.

The teacher’s objectives should reflect and amplify the students’ objectives. It is important in this regard to understand what case teaching can and cannot accomplish. It is not a panacea and certainly cannot accomplish every objective. If we look at the teacher’s task as providing the students with:

- Knowledge
- Techniques
- Skills
- Approaches
- Philosophies
we can help identify those tasks for which the case method is most useful. While cases provide some knowledge, they are inefficient transmitters of knowledge. They can help show the application and limitations of techniques, but they are limited in their ability to describe or provide experience with techniques. Problem sets and exercises are much better at doing that. Cases, however, are very useful in the development of skills, approaches, and a philosophy of management.

The philosophy is that people are important and can “make things happen.” The very art of listening to the ideas of others and of having your ideas listened to in the case classroom highlights the importance of the individual and emphasizes team effort to support the discussion. Because other techniques do other jobs well, the best advice is to use case discussions to accomplish what they can do better than other pedagogical methods. Use lectures, readings, exercises, and so forth to supplement cases and do the other tasks.

We now move to the actual student/teacher relationship.

THE RELATIONSHIP AND THE CONTRACT

Case discussions depend upon the active, effective participation of the students. The student must get involved and take a great deal of—in fact, the primary—responsibility for his or her learning. Thus, the relationship between the student and the teacher is vital to the operation of the case class. The more explicit the contract is, the more clearly each party can understand his or her responsibilities and rights. Probably the most important descriptor of the contract is that it be professional—that is, that each party behave and expect the other to behave with dedication, responsibility, integrity, and a commitment to excellence. Thus: Establish an explicit contract with the students by showing your expectations about their performance and yours early in the course. (If this is the students’ first case course, it is useful to make the contract explicit in the second session, after they have participated in one class discussion. If not, the first class session is the ideal time to begin.) On the students’ side, it is necessary that each be committed to the “4 Ps” of student involvement in case discussions:

1. **Preparation.** If the student does not read and analyze the case, and then formulate an action plan, the case discussion will mean little.

2. **Presence.** If the student is not present, she or he cannot learn and, more important, cannot add her or his unique thoughts and insight to the group discussion.

3. **Promptness.** Students who enter the classroom late disrupt the discussion and deprecate the decorum of the process.

4. **Participation.** Each student’s learning is best facilitated by regular participation. More important, the case student has the responsibility to share his or her understanding and judgment with the class to advance the group’s collective skills and knowledge.
The students will, over time, grow to understand the importance of these four elements, but it is the teacher’s responsibility to **stress very early in the course the importance of student preparation, presence, promptness, and participation.** The instructor should clearly set the example in these areas.

The contract is a two-way street, and the teacher must be willing to more than meet the students’ commitment. On the instructor’s side, the professional nature of the contract and its surrounding relationship will be shown by (1) careful and complete preparation for the classroom experience, (2) concern for and devotion to the students in all dealings, including those in the classroom and in the office, and (3) striving to make the course a satisfying development experience. By and large, the more the teacher does, the more the students will do. **So, show your commitment to the case discussion process by complete preparation of material and concern for student development.** Nothing creates student commitment to preparation as well as having the instructor quote from memory case facts such as numbers in the first class. Students will generally prepare up to, but not beyond, the standards of preparation shown by the instructor.

Preparation to teach must include much more than just reading the case and the teaching note. The instructor must go beyond “preparing the case” to preparing to teach the case. Most new case instructors spend a great deal of time analyzing the case and calculating reams of numbers. That work is important and should not be discouraged. But, it is not enough. The instructor must develop a set of specific teaching objectives that reflect the case, class situation, course, and so forth. He or she must also have a clear idea of the general topics and diagrams that might end up on the chalkboard, and of the questions that might be asked to encourage greater depth and focus in the discussion. The instructor must always have more than enough chalkboard ideas and questions so that she or he can fit their use to the classroom situation. **Have a complete set of teaching objectives and a copious collection of likely board structures and questions.** This brings us to the classroom experience.

### IN CLASS

The most important single rule of case teaching is this: **Have the students accept and maintain ownership of the discussion.** The discussion must be student driven. If the teacher takes the responsibility for ownership of the class, the students can collectively and individually avoid their responsibility for maintaining the quality of the discussion, and the process will degenerate to the instructor’s lecturing about the case.

There are several approaches to encouraging the students to take ownership of the class. One is the contract described earlier. Another is: **Avoid making a choice about the case decision, but force each student to do so.** It is useful to state in the course introduction that “the only person who doesn’t
need to make a decision about the case is me, the instructor." All students should be expected to have a plan of action for the protagonist in the case to ensure that they maximize their learning and can participate actively and effectively in class.

The instructor should understand that in the discussion process, action drives analysis. That is, if a student has made a decision about what to do, the instructor can always focus on the supporting analysis with a question like “Why would you do that?” or “What evidence supports that approach?” The action orientation ensures that the analysis that is done will be relevant to a decision, not just analysis for its own sake.

If the instructor does not have an answer to the case or a choice of an alternative, how can she or he manage the discussion? Use themes to manage the discussion. Themes include topics, areas of analysis, and decisions. The instructor who has a set of themes can manage the class in subtle fashion to ensure that decisions are aired and topics covered. He or she does not have to show the answer. In fact, doing so is counterproductive because it encourages students to develop answers that meet the teacher’s views, rather than approaches that fit the case situation or the student’s skills and abilities. Because implementation is so important, each student must develop approaches and answers that fit her or his talents and judgments.

Use questions to manage the trade-off between depth and breadth, and to heighten conflict. Most cases have too much material to cover in one class session, so the teacher must make choices between depth and breadth. Questions, or perhaps a statement or two, can be used to provide the necessary focus. A question like “How does that relate to the company’s distribution policy?” during a pricing discussion will encourage lateral movement to distribution as a topic; a second or third question about pricing or about the student’s thought process will encourage greater depth of focus on pricing. Because these situations are so delicate and numerous, the instructor needs the copious list of questions described above.

The essence of case discussion is the airing of conflict between two or more opposing views. The best discussions include opposing views that are supportable and reasonable. One of the instructor’s tasks is to clarify and heighten conflicts. The clarification and heightening provide a richness and excitement to the discussion. Students should be encouraged to openly and honestly consider differences of opinion. Comments like “Bill and Betty have differing views, and both can’t be right; will someone clear this up?” are most useful.

Use questions of various types for various purposes. Since questions are so useful in the classroom, the instructor should be able to use a wide variety. Some might be posed to a particular student to...
encourage development of a particular point or to clarify an opinion or statement. Others might be “to the wall, floor, or ceiling.” That is, they are gentle nudges to the discussion and are addressed to no one in particular. “I wonder how the competition would react” is an example of this type of comment or question.

**Use the board to clarify conflicts and issues.** Do not use the board merely as a passive recording device. The board is a very useful device because it is so passive, and also because it is under the general control of the instructor. It can be used to list topics and then prioritize their coverage, or to do “compare and contrast” exercises. Flow diagrams and pro/con lists are examples of other important uses for the board. It is important, however, to understand that students view the chalkboard recording of their comments as important feedback. There is no easy solution to the conflicts this raises, but it should be noted.

**Listen.** If student ownership of the discussion is important, the role of the instructor as listener is perhaps the most critical element in establishing that ownership. The instructor should limit his or her own comments during the discussion and be sure to listen hard and carefully to each comment. This encourages the students to listen to each other and to view participation as serious. Most important, the instructor’s listening establishes the primacy of students’ comments in the classroom.

Listening is a part of another important role: **Provide respect and protection to students and their comments.** Respect and protection are an important part of encouraging students to participate and test ideas. Protection, however, does not mean that standards are low and any off-the-wall idea, even one carefully thought out, is accepted and embraced. It does mean that such a comment is not ridiculed but is gently shown to be “full of holes,” preferably by other students’ comments. Part of the development of standards is to manage conflict so that well-considered, carefully conceived comments gain their rightful merit in the discussion.

**Use humor carefully and constructively.** Humor should not ever be used to ridicule or to punish. It can be used to heighten the conflicts and make relevant points, to help manage the pace of the class, and to increase enjoyment. But the humor should not be forced. If you can’t tell a joke or make a funny quip, don’t try. This is part of a more general thought: **Only do that which is personally comfortable in class.** Humor also can detract from classroom decorum and concentration, and it can take valuable classroom time. It must be used with good judgment.

A reasonably fast pace makes the class more enjoyable and gives the opportunity for greater coverage. **Body language can be used to help pace the class and manage the discussion.** In large classrooms, the teacher’s degree and pace of movement will be reflected to some extent by the pace of the class. It helps to move around the classroom and to stand at different points. Nonverbal gestures can also help manage the discussion. They can, for example, encourage the shy, hesitant student or discourage the student who shouts out comments without being recognized to speak. The teacher’s physical position can also help the students talk to one another. Standing at the side or back of the classroom so that other students are between the speaker and the teacher **helps students talk to one another.** A stronger message, which must be used very selectively, is delivered by standing behind the student.
who is speaking. When the students consistently talk to one another rather than to the teacher, they truly take ownership of the class.

Because learning is such hard work, it is important to make the class an enjoyable experience. The more the students enjoy the class, the more, within limits, they will devote themselves to the class and the less they will resent the hard work of learning. While learning is hard work, it can also be fun!

Finally: Use summary and “offline” lectures to deliver general comments or important related material. Most case discussions end with the instructor delivering a few (2 to 20) minutes’ worth of general comments that review and highlight the discussion (with attribution to students’ comments), structure the issues, and generalize to other situations. There is no reason for a case discussion not to include some lecture. But the instructor should not turn it into a lecture about a case. “Offline” lectures during the discussion can be used to clarify related issues (a legal or regulatory subject, for example) or to cover adjunct material.

The instructor should make it clear that the class is briefly leaving the discussion so that she or he can give a brief “lecturette” and that they will return to the discussion soon. Such diversions should last no more than a few minutes at most.

CLOSING THOUGHTS

The case discussion process depends on a delicate set of relationships: teacher-to-student, student-to-student, and class-to-material. Once the process becomes established, it can accomplish a great deal. Because of the delicacy and power, it is important to nurture the discussion process even if that means trading off some coverage of a case. The process is so important that nurturing it is more important than covering any specific topic in any specific case. The teacher should not suddenly take control of the discussion to cover “one last but important part” in a case discussion and risk hurting the process for future discussions. This is particularly true in early discussions, because they set the tone for the process throughout the course. Because these sessions are so important to the overall experience in the course, put particular emphasis on the development of a good discussion process in early classes, especially the first two.

The instructor, in all that he or she does and particularly with respect to the relationship between the student and teacher, sets the example for the class.

Finally, because the students’ development is so serious and important, and the teacher and classroom experience has such a strong impact, the outstanding instructor must strive for excellence.
PREPARE STUDENTS FOR CASE LEARNING

CASE ANALYSIS COACH: AN ONLINE, SELF-PACED TUTORIAL

The Case Analysis Coach introduces the key concepts required to analyze business case studies. It prepares students for situations including written reports, formal presentations, “cold calls” during classroom discussion, and final exams. It also includes a Case Analysis Worksheet that can be used repeatedly to analyze actual cases assigned for coursework. #4380

“This is a great learning tool for starting case analysis.”
— Review from the HBP for Educators web site*

THE CASE STUDY HANDBOOK: HOW TO READ, DISCUSS, AND WRITE PERSUASIVELY ABOUT CASES

Ideal for Students New to Learning with Cases

Bestselling chapters include:

- What Is a Case? #2448BC
- Analyzing a Case #2449BC
- How to Discuss a Case #2450BC
- How to Write a Case-Based Essay #2451BC

Individual chapters are available for inclusion in a coursepack. #1584

By William Ellet

*Reviews available to registered Premium Educators
CASE METHOD TEACHING SEMINARS

PART I

Intended for all instructors, regardless of their level of experience with participant-centered learning. The seminar covers a broad range of topics, including:

- Establishing and reshaping the learning contract
- Questioning, listening, and responding
- The teacher/student relationship
- Designing the discussion plan
- Practicing the skill

PART II*

Intended for instructors who have at least 3-5 years of experience teaching with cases and who have attended Part I. In the advanced seminar, participants spend more hands-on time devising teaching plans and strategizing how to handle common classroom challenges. The seminar dives more deeply into topics covered in Part I, with emphasis on:

- The learning contract between the instructor and the class/individual students
- Preparing board plans and discussion blocks
- How to open and close a case discussion

RESOURCES FOR INSTRUCTORS

CASES

Because Wisdom Can't Be Told
Suggests the proper role of the instructor as a leader of the group and points out pitfalls to be avoided. #451005

Case Method Teaching
Prepared originally for new instructors in a first-year marketing course, but provides insight into case method teaching generally. #581058

Choreographing a Case Class
Argues the advantages of choreographing a case class and provides tips on how to do so. #595074

LEARN MORE AND SEE CURRENT SEMINAR DATES:
→ casemethod.hbsp.harvard.edu

*Advanced seminar prerequisite: Part I seminar attendance
THE TEACHING POST
SUPPORT FOR YOUR CASE TEACHING

The Teaching Post is an online forum where educators interact with renowned case teaching experts and other instructors who face similar challenges in the classroom. Ask questions, exchange ideas, follow favorite topics, and more. Recent topics include:

- What Are Effective Ways to Wrap Up a Case Discussion?
- Evaluating Student Participation: A Grading Rubric
- What Are Effective Ways to Lead Case Discussions Online?

→ teachingpost.hbsp.harvard.edu

VIDEO ADVICE FOR CASE TEACHING

The Case Method Teaching page on the Harvard Business Publishing for Educators web site is the source for hints and videos on case teaching issues. Over 3 hours of video clips from inside the Harvard Business School classroom cover:

- Advice for new case teachers
- Picking the right case
- Questioning, listening, and responding
- Elements of effective class preparation

→ casemethod.hbsp.harvard.edu

Contact Us:

EMAIL
hbspseminars@hbsp.harvard.edu
WEB
hbsp.harvard.edu

Get updates on Twitter:
@HarvardBizEdu

TEACHING WITH CASES
A PRACTICAL GUIDE

Teaching with Cases focuses on practical advice that can be easily implemented. It covers how to plan a course, how to teach it, and how to evaluate it and provide feedback to students.

By Bill Schiano and Espen Andersen

CHAPTERS INCLUDE:

- Foundations: Preparing for the Course
- Flow During the Class Session
- Feedback: Assignments, Grading, and Guidance
- Managing Classroom Issues
- Quantitative and Technical Material
- Adjusting for Language and Culture
- Preparing for the Next Time
- Fostering Case Teaching at the School Level
- Technologies for Case Teaching

#14095 | eBook Available | $23.95
EXECUTIVE
EDUCATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Articles</th>
<th>$6.95</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cases</td>
<td>$6.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Core Curriculum</td>
<td>$15.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multimedia Cases</td>
<td>$25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Online Courses</td>
<td>$90–$150</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simulations</td>
<td>$45</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

ACADEMIC
PRICE

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Articles</th>
<th>$3.95</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cases</td>
<td>$3.95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Core Curriculum</td>
<td>$7.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multimedia Cases</td>
<td>$8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Online Courses</td>
<td>$45–$75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Simulations</td>
<td>$15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Similar discounts apply to all teaching materials at hbsp.harvard.edu. Prices subject to change without notice.

Annual contracts for academic institutions are also available which provide additional discounts on course materials.

→ BUILD A COURSEPACK NOW: hbsp.harvard.edu

HERE’S HOW TO SHARE THE DISCOUNT:

- Register as a Premium Educator at hbsp.harvard.edu.
- Design and activate a coursepack with content from inside and outside the Harvard Business Publishing catalog.
- Provide the unique coursepack URL to students.
- Students receive your academic discount and save up to 60% on course materials.